

KenVaK
International Advisory Board
Meeting

Future Directions in Research

September 13, 2017

Lisa D. Hinz, Ph.D., ATR-BC

Themes of the Conference

- Effects of arts therapies
- Working factors in the fields of arts therapies
- Experiences of clients and professionals
working with arts therapies
- Directions for future research

Effects of Arts Therapies: Research non Clinical Samples

- Use of art has been found in several studies to reduce anxiety
 - Curry & Kasser (2005)
 - Van der Vennet & Serice (2012)
- Participation with art can increase positive affect, decrease negative affect and increase self-efficacy in non-patient samples.
 - Drake, Coleman & Winner (2011)
 - Kaimal & Ray (2017)
 - Diliberto-Macaluso & Stubblefield (2015)
- Majority of studies not conducted by art therapists and do not consider media properties. The first study to mention that media properties might have an effect on participant experience
 - Northcott & Frein (2017)

Effects of Arts Therapies: Research with Clinical Samples

- RTCs show Art Therapy is an effective intervention for
 - Depression (Nan & Ho, 2017)
 - Anxiety Disorders along with CBT (Riccardi, 2013)
 - PTSD along with CPT (Campbell, et al., 2016)
 - Rehabilitation post stroke along with physical therapy (Kongkasuwan, et al. (2016)
 - Personality Disorders (Haeyen, van Hooren, van der Veld, & Hutschemaekers (in press)
 - Cognitive deficits in the elderly (Alders-Pike, 2013)

Effects of Arts Therapies:

Research with Clinical Samples

- Again, some of this research is not being conducted by art therapists
- Very few Randomized Control Trials are conducted
- Art Therapy often is combined with other therapies and although the add art conditions have proven more effective than other therapies alone, what does this say about our opportunities to conduct research?
 - Interest in performing research
 - Funding sources
 - Collaboration opportunities

Working Factors: Art and the Brain

- Creating art leads to a relaxed focused state similar to meditation effects (Belkofer, Van Hecke, & Konopka, 2014)
- Activation of the medial prefrontal cortex over rest condition (Kaimal, et al., 2017).
- Differential effects found for drawing and working with clay (Kruk, Aravich, Deaver, & deBeus, 2014)

Working Factors: Material Interaction

- Pénzes, van Hooren, Dokter, Smeijsters, & Hutschemaekers, (2016) : through focus groups with art therapists developed categories of material interaction and examined the relationship between material interaction, the art product and clients' psychological characteristics
- Ichiki and Hinz (2015) surveyed 180 American and Japanese art therapists about media preferences, media use, and media properties. Factor analysis derived two distinct healing factors operating through media: one involved movement, sensation, rhythm and playfulness; the second involved cognitive control and conscious thought. Different media were associated with each.

Experiences of Patients and Therapists

- Haeyen, Kleijberg, & Hinz (submitted for publication)
Found positive therapeutic effects of art therapy with Personality Disordered clients were causally explained by combined specific art therapy factors linked to the art media and processes.
 - These factors evoked and helped patients understand and regulate internal images and emotions.
 - Over time patients were able to select media and procedures to fit their unique therapeutic needs.

Future Directions

- Find innovative ways to support art therapists to do research (e.g., Alders-Pike, 2013 collaborative, multisite study)
- Multisite studies can potentially give rise to more Randomized Control Trials
- Collaboration between different art therapy organizations can help advance the research agendas of each (AATA, BATA, etc.)
- Art Therapy can be studied as the principle intervention to demonstrate its therapeutic effects. This requires both quantitative pre/post measures as well as qualitative studies from patient and therapist perspectives.

Future Directions

- From information on working factors derived from both patient and therapist perspectives we can begin to refine our research efforts to describe individualized treatments and “dosage effects”
 - Population Differences: Which arts therapies works best for various populations?
 - Gender Differences
 - Age Differences
 - Cultural Differences
 - Photography
 - Unconventional Materials
- Dosage effects: how much, at what intervals, and in what sequence is the treatment applied?

References

- Belkofer, C. M., Van Hecke, A. V., & Konopka, L. M. (2014). Effects of drawing on alpha activity: A quantitative EEG study with implications for art therapy. *Art Therapy, 31*(2), 61-68.
- Campbell, M., Decker, K. P., Kruk, K., & Deaver, S. P. (2016). Art therapy and cognitive processing therapy for combat-related PTSD: A randomized controlled trial. *Art Therapy, 33*(4), 169-177.
- Curry, N. A. & Kasser, T. (2005). Can Coloring Mandalas Reduce Anxiety? *Art Therapy: Journal of the American Art Therapy Association, 22*(2), 81-85.
- Diliberto-Macaluso, K. A., & Stubblefield, B. L. (2015). The use of painting for short-term mood and arousal improvement. *Psychology Of Aesthetics, Creativity, And The Arts, 9*(3), 228-234.
- Drake, J. E., Coleman, K., & Winner, E. (2011). Short-term mood repair through art: Effects of medium and strategy. *Art Therapy: Journal of the American Art Therapy Association, 28*(1), 26-30.
- Forkosh, J., & Drake, J. E. (2017). Coloring versus drawing: Effects of cognitive demand on mood repair, flow, and enjoyment. *Art Therapy, 34*(2), 75-82.
- Haeyen, S., Kleijberg, M. & Hinz, L.D. (submitted). Art Therapy for Patients with Personality Disorders Cluster B/C: A Thematic Analysis of Emotion Regulation from Patient and Art Therapist Perspectives. *International Journal of Art Therapy*
- Haeyen S, van Hooren S, van der Veld W, Hutschemaekers G. (in press). Efficacy of art therapy in individuals with personality disorders cluster B/C. A randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Personality Disorders*.
- Ichiki, Y., & Hinz, L. D. (2015, July). *Exploring Media Properties and the Expressive Therapies Continuum: Survey of Art Therapists*. Paper presented at the American Art Therapy Association conference, Minneapolis, MN.

References

- Kaimal, G., Ayaz, H., Herres, J., Dieterich-Hartwell, R., Makwana, B., Kaiser, D.H., & Nasser, J.A. (2017). Functional near-infrared spectroscopy assessment of reward perception based on visual self-expression: Coloring, doodling, and free drawing. *The Arts in Psychotherapy, 55*, 85–92.
- Kaimal, G. & Ray K. (2017). Free art making in an art therapy open studio: Changes in affect and self-efficacy. *Arts and Health, 9*(2), 154-166.
- Kongkasuwan, R., Voraakhom, K., Pisolayabutra, P., Maneechai, P., Boonin, J., & Kuptniratsaikul, V. (2016). Creative art therapy to enhance rehabilitation for stroke patients: A randomized controlled trial. *Clinical Rehabilitation, 30*(10), 1016-1023.
- Nan, J.K.M., Ho, R. T. H. (2017). Effects of clay art therapy on adults outpatients with major depressive disorder: A randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Affective Disorders, 217*, 237–245.
- Northcott, J. L., & Frein, S. T. (2017). The effect of drawing exercises on mood when negative affect is not induced. *Art Therapy, 34*(2), 92-95.
- Péntzes, I., van Hooren, S., Dokter, D., Smeijsters, H., & Hutschemaekers, G. (2016). Material interaction and art product in art therapy assessment in adult mental health. *Arts & Health: An International Journal of Research, Policy and Practice, 8*(3), 213-228.
- Pike, A. A. (2013). The effect of art therapy on cognitive performance among ethnically diverse older adults. *Art Therapy, 30*(4), 159-168.
- Riccardi, M. (2013). *The Expressive Therapies Continuum: A Framework for Anxiety Disorders*. Paper presented at the American Art Therapy Association (AATA) 44th Annual Conference, Seattle, WA.
- van der Vennet, R., & Serice, S. (2012). Can coloring mandalas reduce anxiety? A replication study. *Art Therapy: Journal of the American Art Therapy Association, 29*(2), 87-92.